



Do JCAHO accredited hospitals perform better on quality measures? An analysis of process-of-care measures and surgical indicators.

William B Weeks, MD, MBA ¹⁻⁴

Jared Schmidek, MS ³

Amy E Wallace, MD, MPH ^{1,4}

Justin Dimick, MD, MS ^{1,5}

¹ VA Outcomes Group REAP, White River Junction, VT, VAMC

² Field Office, VA's National Center for Patient Safety, White River Junction, VT, VAMC

³ Dartmouth's Center for the Evaluative Clinical Sciences, Hanover, NH

⁴ Department of Psychiatry, Dartmouth Medical School, Hanover, NH

⁵ Department of Surgery, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, MI

JCAHO accreditation

- Expensive
- Time consuming
- Little evidence of relationship with better performance on process of care measures
 - Among JCAHO accredited hospitals, 0/8 studies demonstrated consistent relationship between accreditation scores
 - When compared to non-accredited hospitals, 2 found that JCAHO accreditation is associated with better performance
- No studies have examined relationship between accreditation and surgical outcomes

Objective

- To examine the relationship between JCAHO accreditation status, scores and both process of care and surgical outcomes

Methods

- For 2000 – 2003
 - JCAHO dataset – accreditation status and scores for 4,270 surveyed hospitals
 - AHA dataset – information on number of beds, type of hospital, and ownership for 6,229 hospitals
 - Hospital compare – 17 process of care measures for discharges
 - Medicare – measures of surgical outcomes for 14 procedures

Surgical outcomes

- For 14 procedures that demonstrate variation in outcomes, that can be predicted by
 - historical procedures volume
 - historical risk-adjusted mortality rates
 - the combination of the two

Methods

- Eliminate critical access hospitals
- Categorize performance for process of care and surgical outcomes into quintiles of performance
- Compare accredited vs. non-accredited (1,0)
- Among accredited, categorize accreditation scores into quintiles
- Chi-square test
 - Is accreditation associated with higher levels of performance?
 - Are higher scores associated with higher levels of performance?

Sample

| | Non-JCAHO accredited hospitals | JCAHO accredited hospitals | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--|--------------------------------|--------------------------------|-------|------------------|-----|-------------|-----|-------------|-----|-------------|-----|-----------------|-----|-------------|--|
| | | All JCAHO accredited hospitals | | 1 Highest Scores | | 2 | | 3 | | 4 | | 5 Lowest Scores | | | |
| Overall Evaluation Score, (range) | | 74 – 100 | | 96 – 100 | | 94 – 95 | | 92 – 93 | | 89 – 91 | | 74 – 88 | | | |
| No. of hospitals, N | 752 | 2,694 (100) | | 560 (20.8) | | 490 (18.2) | | 558 (20.7) | | 591 (21.9) | | 495 (18.4) | | | |
| Mean overall evaluation score, (S.D.) | - | 92.0 (4.0) | | 97.0 (1.0) | | 94.3 (0.5) | | 92.5 (0.5) | | 90.2 (0.8) | | 85.7 (2.5) | | | |
| Accreditation Level, N (%) | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Full standards compliance | - | 301 (100) | | 212 (70.4) | | 50 (16.6) | | 22 (7.3) | | 13 (4.3) | | 4 (1.3) | | | |
| Requirements for improvement | - | 2,372 (100) | | 348 (14.7) | | 439 (18.5) | | 536 (22.6) | | 576 (24.3) | | 473 (19.9) | | | |
| Conditional accreditation | - | 21 (100) | | - | | 1 (4.8) | | - | | 2 (9.5) | | 18 (85.7) | | | |
| | N (%) | N (%) | | N (%) | | N (%) | | N (%) | | N (%) | | N (%) | | | |
| Type of Hospital Ownership | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| AHA* survey year | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2000 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Total | 736 (100) | 2,677 (100) | | 554 (100) | | 488 (100) | | 556 (100) | | 584 (100) | | 495 (100) | | | |
| Not-for-profit | 435 (59.1) | 1,780 (66.5) | | 379 (68.4) | | 328 (67.2) | | 358 (64.5) | | 403 (69.0) | | 312 (63.0) | | | |
| Government, Non federal | 219 (29.8) | 415 (15.5) | | 80 (14.4) | | 75 (15.4) | | 91 (16.4) | | 89 (15.2) | | 80 (16.2) | | | |
| Investor-owned (for-profit) | 82 (11.1) | 482 (18.0) | | 95 (17.2) | | 85 (17.4) | | 107 (19.2) | | 92 (15.8) | | 103 (20.8) | | | |
| 2001 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Total | 707 (100) | 2,683 (100) | | 558 (100) | | 489 (100) | | 557 (100) | | 585 (100) | | 494 (100) | | | |
| Not-for-profit | 415 (58.7) | 1,783 (66.5) | | 382 (68.5) | | 326 (66.7) | | 358 (64.3) | | 407 (69.6) | | 310 (62.8) | | | |
| Government, Non federal | 221 (31.3) | 415 (15.5) | | 81 (14.5) | | 75 (15.3) | | 92 (16.5) | | 86 (14.7) | | 81 (16.4) | | | |
| Investor-owned (for-profit) | 71 (10.0) | 485 (18.1) | | 95 (17.0) | | 88 (18.0) | | 107 (19.2) | | 92 (15.7) | | 103 (20.9) | | | |
| 2002 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Total | 680 (100) | 2,682 (100) | | 559 (100) | | 486 (100) | | 558 (100) | | 585 (100) | | 494 (100) | | | |
| Not-for-profit | 398 (58.5) | 1,780 (66.4) | | 379 (67.8) | | 323 (66.5) | | 361 (64.7) | | 407 (69.6) | | 310 (62.8) | | | |
| Government, Non federal | 214 (31.5) | 413 (15.4) | | 81 (14.5) | | 73 (15.0) | | 91 (16.3) | | 86 (14.7) | | 82 (16.6) | | | |
| Investor-owned (for-profit) | 68 (10.0) | 489 (18.2) | | 99 (17.7) | | 90 (18.5) | | 106 (19.0) | | 92 (15.7) | | 102 (20.7) | | | |
| 2003 | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Total | 655 (100) | 2,675 (100) | | 558 (100) | | 483 (100) | | 557 (100) | | 585 (100) | | 492 (100) | | | |
| Not-for-profit | 378 (57.7) | 1,765 (66.0) | | 376 (67.4) | | 320 (66.3) | | 358 (64.3) | | 406 (69.4) | | 305 (62.0) | | | |
| Government, Non federal | 210 (32.1) | 407 (15.2) | | 82 (14.7) | | 71 (14.7) | | 88 (15.8) | | 85 (14.5) | | 81 (16.5) | | | |
| Investor-owned (for-profit) | 67 (10.2) | 503 (18.8) | | 100 (17.9) | | 92 (19.1) | | 111 (19.9) | | 94 (16.1) | | 106 (21.5) | | | |
| | N | Mean (S.D.) | N | Mean (S.D.) | N | Mean (S.D.) | N | Mean (S.D.) | N | Mean (S.D.) | N | Mean (S.D.) | N | Mean (S.D.) | |
| Number of Hospital Beds | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2000 | 736 | 144 (164) | 2,677 | 219 (186)† | 554 | 212 (179) | 488 | 205 (178) | 556 | 224 (178) | 584 | 233 (197) | 495 | 221 (195) | |
| 2001 | 706 | 140 (159) | 2,683 | 222 (189)† | 558 | 213 (185) | 489 | 207 (183) | 557 | 225 (178) | 585 | 238 (200) | 494 | 222 (198) | |
| 2002 | 676 | 135 (155) | 2,669 | 220 (187)† | 556 | 213 (185) | 485 | 207 (181) | 556 | 224 (174) | 584 | 237 (199) | 488 | 218 (195) | |
| 2003 | 640 | 135 (165) | 2,591 | 222 (190)† | 546 | 212 (184) | 472 | 207 (181) | 542 | 226 (179) | 568 | 237 (203) | 463 | 222 (199) | |

| Process of Care Measure | Non-JCAHO accredited hospitals | | | JCAHO accredited hospitals | | | p value |
|--|--------------------------------|------------|----------------------|----------------------------|------------|----------------------|---------|
| | N Hosp | N Patients | Weighted Mean (S.D.) | N Hosp | N Patients | Weighted Mean (S.D.) | |
| Acute Myocardial Infarction | | | | | | | |
| ACE-I* for left ventricular systolic dysfunction | 367 | 5,511 | 78.7 (15.9) | 2,247 | 43,930 | 78.4 (14.8) | 0.7 |
| Aspirin at arrival | 585 | 23,782 | 93.5 (7.4) | 2,613 | 167,064 | 94.3 (5.6) | 0.02 |
| Aspirin at discharge | 551 | 23,413 | 92.9 (9.8) | 2,565 | 183,801 | 94.1 (7.9) | 0.01 |
| β-blocker at arrival | 584 | 20,819 | 87.9 (12.6) | 2,609 | 147,181 | 88.8 (10.1) | 0.1 |
| β-blocker at discharge | 554 | 23,411 | 90.7 (10.7) | 2,568 | 184,527 | 91.4 (8.8) | 0.1 |
| PTCA within 90 minutes of arrival | 40 | 427 | 41.2 (24.4) | 280 | 3,015 | 38.1 (22.6) | 0.5 |
| Smoking cessation advice/counseling | 203 | 3,144 | 84.0 (18.4) | 1,539 | 24,330 | 83.3 (18.7) | 0.6 |
| Thrombolytic agent within 30 minutes of arrival | 65 | 210 | 44.8 (33.2) | 309 | 1,032 | 38.7 (28.8) | 0.2 |
| Heart Failure | | | | | | | |
| ACE-I* for left ventricular systolic dysfunction | 576 | 17,618 | 74.6 (14.5) | 2,609 | 130,020 | 75.5 (13.5) | 0.2 |
| Assessment of left ventricular function | 651 | 57,601 | 82.3 (17.1) | 2,640 | 385,801 | 86.3 (11.4) | <0.001 |
| Discharge instructions | 419 | 16,699 | 46.4 (27.4) | 2,123 | 120,953 | 48.4 (28.5) | 0.2 |
| Smoking cessation advice/counseling | 361 | 3,414 | 66.6 (26.4) | 2,050 | 24,087 | 68.2 (27.2) | 0.3 |
| Pneumonia | | | | | | | |
| Blood culture before 1 st antibiotic | 411 | 14,450 | 82.9 (10.0) | 2,113 | 109,209 | 82.5 (9.9) | 0.5 |
| Initial antibiotic timing | 653 | 63,884 | 71.8 (12.4) | 2,626 | 410,328 | 69.0 (11.8) | <0.001 |
| Oxygenation assessment | 653 | 65,288 | 97.7 (5.5) | 2,626 | 422,229 | 98.4 (4.0) | 0.003 |
| Pneumococcal vaccination | 648 | 35,532 | 42.7 (26.0) | 2,624 | 226,663 | 43.4 (25.7) | 0.5 |
| Smoking cessation advice/counseling | 392 | 3,788 | 63.1 (27.0) | 2,091 | 27,743 | 63.9 (27.6) | 0.6 |

| Quintile | 1 Highest Scores | | | 2 | | | 3 | | | 4 | | | 5 Lowest Scores | | | p value |
|--|---------------------|------------|----------------------|--------|------------|----------------------|--------|------------|----------------------|--------|------------|----------------------|--------------------|------------|----------------------|------------------|
| | N Hosp | N Patients | Weighted Mean (S.D.) | N Hosp | N Patients | Weighted Mean (S.D.) | N Hosp | N Patients | Weighted Mean (S.D.) | N Hosp | N Patients | Weighted Mean (S.D.) | N Hosp | N Patients | Weighted Mean (S.D.) | |
| Acute Myocardial Infarction | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| ACE-I* for left ventricular systolic dysfunction | 462 | 9,165 | 77.7 (15.1) | 390 | 7,611 | 76.9 (15.6) | 474 | 9,173 | 79.8 (14.2) | 503 | 10,469 | 78.2 (14.3) | 418 | 7,512 | 79.1 (14.8) | 0.03 |
| Aspirin at arrival | 544 | 34,130 | 94.2 (5.4) | 475 | 29,725 | 94.1 (5.8) | 545 | 35,354 | 94.7 (5.5) | 576 | 38,073 | 94.0 (5.6) | 473 | 29,782 | 94.6 (5.7) | 0.2 |
| Aspirin at discharge | 530 | 38,201 | 94.2 (7.3) | 465 | 31,511 | 92.8 (10.3) | 535 | 38,255 | 94.6 (6.8) | 569 | 43,033 | 94.4 (7.1) | 466 | 32,801 | 94.4 (7.9) | 0.004 |
| β-blocker at arrival | 543 | 29,899 | 88.6 (9.5) | 472 | 26,078 | 88.0 (10.8) | 545 | 30,851 | 90.1 (9.2) | 574 | 33,611 | 88.1 (10.2) | 475 | 26,742 | 89.1 (11.0) | 0.005 |
| β-blocker at discharge | 534 | 38,336 | 91.3 (7.9) | 464 | 31,832 | 90.2 (10.5) | 533 | 38,316 | 92.2 (7.5) | 569 | 43,290 | 91.7 (8.8) | 468 | 32,753 | 91.6 (9.1) | 0.008 |
| PTCA within 90 minutes of arrival | 58 | 627 | 39.0 (22.5) | 45 | 541 | 37.1 (21.1) | 69 | 687 | 35.6 (23.8) | 57 | 605 | 38.6 (20.1) | 51 | 555 | 40.8 (25.6) | 0.8 |
| Smoking cessation advice/counseling | 310 | 5,037 | 82.9 (19.5) | 266 | 4,109 | 84.1 (17.6) | 334 | 5,379 | 85.1 (17.3) | 339 | 5,448 | 83.2 (19.0) | 290 | 4,357 | 81.0 (20.0) | 0.1 |
| Thrombolytic agent within 30 minutes of arrival | 70 | 204 | 39.8 (27.2) | 59 | 163 | 39.9 (31.7) | 61 | 214 | 33.7 (30.0) | 65 | 243 | 42.0 (30.0) | 54 | 208 | 37.9 (25.9) | 0.5 |
| Heart Failure | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| ACE-I* for left ventricular systolic dysfunction | 541 | 27,350 | 74.7 (13.5) | 476 | 22,645 | 75.1 (13.1) | 544 | 28,467 | 76.2 (12.9) | 573 | 30,398 | 75.8 (13.4) | 475 | 21,160 | 75.6 (14.7) | 0.4 |
| Assessment of left ventricular function | 549 | 80,558 | 86.1 (11.1) | 479 | 66,823 | 86.3 (12.0) | 550 | 84,288 | 87.1 (10.7) | 581 | 89,187 | 86.6 (11.6) | 481 | 64,945 | 85.2 (11.9) | 0.1 |
| Discharge instructions | 446 | 25,121 | 50.4 (28.0) | 388 | 21,126 | 50.4 (29.7) | 441 | 26,456 | 49.2 (27.1) | 463 | 27,084 | 47.3 (29.1) | 385 | 21,166 | 44.7 (28.6) | 0.02 |
| Smoking cessation advice/counseling | 430 | 4,979 | 70.9 (27.5) | 372 | 4,231 | 69.4 (26.8) | 430 | 5,325 | 68.4 (25.9) | 456 | 5,427 | 67.9 (27.7) | 362 | 4,125 | 64.0 (27.9) | 0.01 |
| Pneumonia | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Blood culture before 1 st antibiotic | 450 | 22,104 | 82.7 (9.8) | 389 | 19,646 | 83.3 (10.9) | 437 | 23,462 | 83.1 (9.6) | 462 | 25,043 | 81.8 (9.8) | 375 | 18,954 | 81.8 (9.2) | 0.09 |
| Initial antibiotic timing | 548 | 83,165 | 68.6 (11.9) | 480 | 70,909 | 70.5 (11.6) | 545 | 87,625 | 69.3 (11.3) | 578 | 94,560 | 68.1 (12.2) | 475 | 74,069 | 69.1 (11.9) | 0.07 |
| Oxygenation assessment | 548 | 85,255 | 98.4 (3.7) | 480 | 72,572 | 98.4 (3.9) | 545 | 90,093 | 98.5 (3.5) | 578 | 97,851 | 98.2 (5.1) | 475 | 76,458 | 98.5 (3.7) | 0.8 |
| Pneumococcal vaccination | 548 | 45,546 | 44.3 (25.3) | 480 | 39,371 | 45.2 (26.3) | 544 | 49,370 | 44.5 (25.4) | 577 | 51,553 | 42.3 (25.9) | 475 | 40,823 | 41.1 (25.7) | 0.07 |
| Smoking cessation advice/counseling | 441 | 5,762 | 66.6 (28.4) | 386 | 4,830 | 66.3 (27.8) | 428 | 5,899 | 63.3 (26.1) | 458 | 6,187 | 63.6 (28.1) | 378 | 5,065 | 59.8 (26.8) | 0.003 |

Almost invariably,
accreditation status is
associated with better
surgical outcomes

| Surgical Procedure | Expected Volume | Expected Mortality | Combined |
|----------------------------------|-----------------|----------------------|----------------------|
| Abdominal aortic aneurysm repair | 1999 | 0.57 (0.50 – 0.66)* | 0.83 (0.72 – 0.95)† |
| | 2000 | 0.78 (0.67 – 0.90)* | 0.81 (0.70 – 0.94)† |
| | 2001 | 0.51 (0.43 – 0.60)* | 0.70 (0.60 – 0.83)* |
| Aortic valve replacement | 1999 | 0.66 (0.57 – 0.75)* | 1.05 (0.93 – 1.18) |
| | 2000 | 0.45 (0.38 – 0.52)* | 0.49 (0.43 – 0.55)* |
| | 2001 | 0.23 (0.19 – 0.27)* | 0.71 (0.62 – 0.81)* |
| Coronary artery bypass graft | 1999 | 1.18 (1.12 – 1.24)* | 0.99 (0.94 – 1.04) |
| | 2000 | 1.30 (1.24 – 1.37)* | 0.83 (0.78 – 0.88)* |
| | 2001 | 1.25 (1.19 – 1.32)* | 0.86 (0.81 – 0.91)* |
| Carotid endarterectomy | 1999 | 0.65 (0.60 – 0.69)* | 1.14 (1.07 – 1.23)* |
| | 2000 | 0.66 (0.62 – 0.71)* | 0.86 (0.80 – 0.93)* |
| | 2001 | 0.59 (0.55 – 0.63)* | 0.87 (0.81 – 0.94)* |
| Colectomy | 1999 | 0.59 (0.55 – 0.64)* | 0.87 (0.80 – 0.95)* |
| | 2000 | 0.54 (0.49 – 0.58)* | 0.81 (0.75 – 0.88)* |
| | 2001 | 0.63 (0.58 – 0.68)* | 0.87 (0.81 – 0.95)* |
| Cystectomy | 1999 | 0.56 (0.38 – 0.82)† | 0.54 (0.37 – 0.78)* |
| | 2000 | 0.59 (0.40 – 0.86)† | 0.99 (0.70 – 1.38) |
| | 2001 | 0.20 (0.11 – 0.34)* | 0.49 (0.33 – 0.72)* |
| Esophagectomy | 1999 | 0.00 (0.00 – 0.31)*§ | 0.35 (0.15 – 0.79)† |
| | 2000 | 0.00 (0.00 – 0.43)*§ | 0.00 (0.00 – 0.36)*§ |
| | 2001 | 0.00 (0.00 – 0.31)*§ | 0.00 (0.00 – 0.23)*§ |
| Gastrectomy | 1999 | 0.35 (0.24 – 0.51)* | 0.70 (0.50 – 0.98)‡ |
| | 2000 | 0.54 (0.39 – 0.75)* | 0.97 (0.71 – 1.34) |
| | 2001 | 0.34 (0.23 – 0.49)* | 0.73 (0.52 – 1.01)‡ |
| Lower extremity bypass | 1999 | 0.64 (0.58 – 0.71)* | 1.14 (1.03 – 1.26)† |
| | 2000 | 0.58 (0.53 – 0.65)* | 1.05 (0.95 – 1.15) |
| | 2001 | 0.53 (0.47 – 0.59)* | 0.76 (0.69 – 0.84)* |
| Lung lobectomy | 1999 | 0.31 (0.25 – 0.39)* | 0.73 (0.60 – 0.89)† |
| | 2000 | 0.17 (0.12 – 0.22)* | 0.60 (0.50 – 0.71)* |
| | 2001 | 0.21 (0.16 – 0.27)* | 0.49 (0.40 – 0.59)* |
| Mitral valve replacement | 1999 | 0.78 (0.63 – 0.96)‡ | 0.62 (0.50 – 0.77)* |
| | 2000 | 0.86 (0.70 – 1.06) | 0.53 (0.42 – 0.67)* |
| | 2001 | 0.54 (0.42 – 0.68)* | 0.46 (0.36 – 0.59)* |
| Nephrectomy | 1999 | 0.53 (0.43 – 0.66)* | 0.85 (0.70 – 1.04) |
| | 2000 | 0.79 (0.65 – 0.95)‡ | 1.14 (0.93 – 1.39) |
| | 2001 | 0.69 (0.57 – 0.84)* | 0.97 (0.80 – 1.19) |
| Pancreatectomy | 1999 | 0.00 (0.00 – 0.11)*§ | 0.45 (0.22 – 0.90)‡ |
| | 2000 | 0.00 (0.00 – 0.10)*§ | 0.00 (0.00 – 0.13)*§ |
| | 2001 | 0.00 (0.00 – 0.11)*§ | 0.33 (0.16 – 0.66)* |
| Pneumonectomy | 1999 | 0.18 (0.06 – 0.45)* | 1.05 (0.58 – 1.92) |
| | 2000 | 0.34 (0.15 – 0.69)† | 0.97 (0.52 – 1.77) |
| | 2001 | 0.80 (0.41 – 1.55) | 0.66 (0.34 – 1.26) |

* p-value equal to or less than 0.001. † p-value less or equal to 0.01
‡ p-value less than 0.05 § p-value for a two-tailed Fisher's exact test
(used where a cell contained a value of 5 or less).

About ½ the time,
higher accreditation
scores are associated
with better surgical
outcomes

Consistently so for
colectomy

Strong trend for non-
cancer resections

| Surgical Procedure | Expected Volume | Expected Mortality | Combined |
|----------------------------------|-----------------|----------------------|----------------------|
| Abdominal aortic aneurysm repair | 1999 | 1.05 (0.91 - 1.22) | 2.73 (2.19 - 3.40)* |
| | 2000 | 1.05 (0.90 - 1.23) | 1.27 (1.03 - 1.57)† |
| | 2001 | 0.93 (0.79 - 1.09) | 0.88 (0.70 - 1.09) |
| Aortic valve replacement | 1999 | 1.10 (0.95 - 1.27) | 0.00 (0.00 - 0.01)‡ |
| | 2000 | 1.33 (1.16 - 1.53)* | 1.00 (0.78 - 1.28) |
| | 2001 | 1.75 (1.53 - 2.01)* | 0.32 (0.26 - 0.39)* |
| Coronary artery bypass graft | 1999 | 1.32 (1.24 - 1.40)* | 0.53 (0.47 - 0.59)* |
| | 2000 | 1.31 (1.24 - 1.39)* | 0.00 (0.00 - 0.001)‡ |
| | 2001 | 1.33 (1.26 - 1.41)* | 0.00 (0.00 - 0.002)‡ |
| Carotid endarterectomy | 1999 | 1.17 (1.08 - 1.27)* | 2.87 (2.50 - 3.31)* |
| | 2000 | 1.07 (0.99 - 1.16) | 2.42 (2.15 - 2.73)* |
| | 2001 | 0.97 (0.90 - 1.05) | 1.24 (1.10 - 1.40)* |
| Colectomy | 1999 | 1.03 (0.92 - 1.15) | 0.91 (0.76 - 1.09) |
| | 2000 | 1.31 (1.17 - 1.46)* | 1.21 (1.02 - 1.45)† |
| | 2001 | 1.43 (1.28 - 1.60)* | 1.70 (1.44 - 2.00)* |
| Cystectomy | 1999 | 0.87 (0.60 - 1.28) | 0.55 (0.32 - 0.96)† |
| | 2000 | 1.16 (0.80 - 1.68) | 1.50 (0.82 - 2.77) |
| | 2001 | 1.29 (0.90 - 1.85) | 0.83 (0.48 - 1.43) |
| Esophagectomy | 1999 | 1.27 (0.56 - 2.87) | 0.00 (0.00 - 0.59)‡§ |
| | 2000 | 0.00 (0.00 - 0.57)‡§ | 0.00 (0.00 - 0.29)‡ |
| | 2001 | 1.47 (0.48 - 4.43) | 1.17 (0.38 - 3.54) |
| Gastrectomy | 1999 | 3.05 (2.13 - 4.37)* | Cell C contains zero |
| | 2000 | 3.22 (2.21 - 4.70)* | 1.29 (0.73 - 2.29) |
| | 2001 | 2.26 (1.61 - 3.19)* | 0.97 (0.58 - 1.62) |
| Lower extremity bypass | 1999 | 1.13 (1.01 - 1.27)† | 0.83 (0.69 - 1.00)† |
| | 2000 | 1.28 (1.15 - 1.43)* | 1.38 (1.18 - 1.62)* |
| | 2001 | 1.24 (1.11 - 1.37)* | 1.28 (1.09 - 1.50)§ |
| Lung lobectomy | 1999 | 1.77 (1.45 - 2.15)* | 1.12 (0.83 - 1.50) |
| | 2000 | 1.67 (1.37 - 2.03)* | 1.39 (1.07 - 1.80)† |
| | 2001 | 1.50 (1.22 - 1.82)* | 0.85 (0.64 - 1.12) |
| Mitral valve replacement | 1999 | 1.69 (1.35 - 2.11)* | 0.47 (0.33 - 0.69)* |
| | 2000 | 1.44 (1.16 - 1.78)* | 0.00 (0.00 - 0.02)‡ |
| | 2001 | 1.27 (1.03 - 1.57)† | 0.20 (0.14 - 0.28)* |
| Nephrectomy | 1999 | 1.82 (1.44 - 2.30)* | 1.99 (1.41 - 2.83)* |
| | 2000 | 1.50 (1.19 - 1.89)* | 0.85 (0.59 - 1.22) |
| | 2001 | 1.38 (1.11 - 1.73)§ | 1.52 (1.06 - 2.18)† |
| Pancreatectomy | 1999 | 0.52 (0.28 - 0.96)† | 0.74 (0.41 - 1.35) |
| | 2000 | 0.63 (0.32 - 1.23) | 0.46 (0.25 - 0.83)§ |
| | 2001 | 0.40 (0.20 - 0.80)§ | 0.32 (0.16 - 0.61)* |
| Pneumonectomy | 1999 | 1.05 (0.58 - 1.90) | 3.19 (0.96 - 10.89)† |
| | 2000 | 1.04 (0.56 - 1.94) | 0.00 (0.00 - 0.40)‡ |
| | 2001 | 1.15 (0.58 - 2.27) | 0.82 (0.27 - 2.48) |



* p-value equal to or less than 0.001. † p-value less or equal to 0.01
‡ p-value less than 0.05 § p-value for a two-tailed Fisher's exact test
(used where a cell contained a value of 5 or less).

Conclusions

- JCAHO scores do not reliably differentiate hospitals on process of care measures
- JCAHO accreditation status no longer differentiates hospitals on process of care measures; differences are trivial
- JCAHO accreditation is a consistent marker for better surgical outcomes
- Scores are associated with surgical outcomes for non-cancer resections

Limitations

- Data from 2000 – 2003
- Associations
- Cross sectional

However

- JCAHO's recent decision to no longer report scores makes sense: scores don't matter for process of care measures; inconsistent for surgical outcomes (depends on the procedure)
- JCAHO accreditation status might matter; however, the difference is likely to erode over time
 - Stronger relationship between accreditation status and process of care in earlier studies
 - Before measures widely available, a clear relationship with surgical outcomes
- Therefore, the accreditation process might raise performance of all boats, including those not being accredited