

District of Columbia Primary Care Needs Assessment Study:

Quantitative Determinants of the need and demand for primary care in the District of Columbia, 1985-2004

Jacob Andoh, Ph.D (cand), MS, MPH, CPM Department of Human Services, Washington, DC *jyandoh@yahoo.com*

The nation's capital, Washington, D.C. a.k.a. the District of Columbia



dcpc:

"District of Columbia Primary Care Needs Assessment Methodology:

- Was commissioned in 1985 by Andrew D. McBride, MD, MPH, former Commissioner of Public Health, to inform the work of the Public Primary Care Task Force's work on the integration of the public primary care sectors
- Originally intended to be a comprehensive, quantitative assessment of the need, and demand, for primary care services in the District of Columbia for 1985-1990
- Developed by author into a 20-year study (1985 to 2005) spanning three discrete study periods: 1984-85, 1990-1992 and 2004-2005
- Uses a methodology originally developed by NYS Health Planning Commission for population-based needs assessment that is need/demand (not utilization) driven



Primary Care defined:

- Primary Care Physicians Three groups are defined in this DCPC study – 1.General Primary Care Physicians (GPC); 2.
 Specialist Primary Care Physicians (SPC) and Specialists (S)
- GPC General Primary Care refers to all physicians of the following five specialties
- GP General Practice
- FP Family Practice
- OB/GYN Obstetrics/Gynaecology
- PED Paediatrics
- IM Internal Medicine.

Objectives of the DCPC study:

- To measure the level of physician supply and primary care services <u>geographically available</u> to satisfy the needs of District residents
- 2. To determine if available services were adequate to meet present and foreseeable future needs of the District
- 3. To provide baseline data to be used in the future for evaluating and planning for primary care resources and services in the District

LIMITATION:

The DCPC study did not specifically address issues of accessibility, affordability, costs or quality)

How best to determine need and demand for primary care in an urban community?



dcpc: Methodology

- The basic methodology (courtesy of NYS DOH/HPC) hinges on derivation of three statistical indices (or indexes):
- 1.PCSI primary care service index: measure of access to physicians for residents of a small area (census tract)
- 2. CNS composite need score: derived from data on populations with incomes below the federal poverty level (POV) and low birth-weight (LBW)
- 3. PCPS primary care priority score: PCSI and CNS are statistically combined to create a new index, priority score, which provides an objective basis for need/demand assessment and primary care resource allocation
- DCPC methodology goes beyond the federal Health Manpower Shortage Area (HMSA) designation methodology. DCPC combines manpower availability with objective estimates of community need for primary care resources to generate primary care profiles for small areas

Index #1: Primary Care Service Index:

PCSI – primary care service index: measure of access to physicians for residents of a small area (census tract)

Satisfied Visits
PCSI = ----- Total Potential ("poor" + "non-poor") Visits

Index #2: Composite Need Score:

CNS composite need score, standardized to 100

CNS score = Rank (% population with incomes below the federal poverty level (POV)) + Rank (% low birthweight (LBW))

Low CNS score (e.g.1) indicates high need High CNS score (e.g. 100) indicates low need, relative to other census tracts (or Census Tract Groupings).

Index #3: Primary Care Priority Score:

PCPS Primary Care Priority Score:

- PCPS is a number (=1 or 2 or 3) **obtained by cross-tabulating PCSI and CNS values** for a small area (CT or CTG)
- PCSI = 1 high need for primary care resources
- = 2 moderate need
 - = 3 low need
- The primary care priority score provides an objective basis for making <u>primary care resource allocation</u> decisions.

Cross-tabulation of PCSI and CNS values to obtain Primary Care Priority Scores for a CTG

	PCSI							
	1	1 2 3 4						
	(very low	(low	(med	(med	(high			
	satisfied	satisfied	satisfied	high	satisfied			
	visits)	visits)	visits)	satisfied	visits)			
				visits)				
CNS								
1 (high need)	<u>1-HIGH</u>	1-HIGH	2-MED	2-MED	2-MED			
2 (med high)	1-HIGH	1-HIGH	2-MED	2-MED	2-MED			
3 (med low)	2-MED	2-MED	2-MED	3-LOW	3-LOW			
4 (low need)	2-MED	2-MED	2-MED	3-LOW	<u>3-LOW</u>			

TO DETERMINE PC SHORTAGE AREAS:

Estimates of Varying Physician Productivity

(Visits per Year for Areas with Different Physician Density Levels) Source: NHIS; NCHS; NYS HPC, 1984

1 n	<u>hysician can don</u>	PHYSICIAN DENSITY			
		LOW	MEDIUM	HIGH	
	Physician (Visits/Year) :				
	Primary Care Physicians	8,226	5,795	4,714	
	Other Physicians	5,153	4,301	3,757	
	FTEs:				
	Primary Care Fraction of Practice:				
	Primary Care Physicians	1.0	1.0	1.0	
	Other Physicians	0.5	0.3	0.1	

1 Resident can make

Est. Primary Care Physician <u>Visits Per Person</u> Per Year for Poor and Non-Poor Persons

Source: NHIS; NCHS; NYS HPC, 1984

	AGE: Under 15	15-44	45-64	65+
Primary Care Visits Per Person per Year:				
Non-Poor	3.3	3.4	4.0	5.1
Poor (Adjusted)	4.2	6.0	11.1	8.1

dcpc : Overview of the Methodology:

Resident



Study Terminology:

- District of Columbia
- DCPC: District of Columbia Primary Care (Needs Assessment)
- CT: Census Tract
- *CTG:* Census Tract Grouping(s)
- PCSI: Primary Care Service Index
- *CNS:* Composite Need Score
- PCPS: Primary Care Priority Score
- P.P.P.P.P. "The Five P's" major stakeholders in issues and discussions of primary care planning, organization, delivery and financing. They are the planners, policymakers, primary care practitioners/physicians, other providers, and the public.
- *HMSA:* Health Manpower Shortage Area
 - Health Professional Shortage Area
 - Medically Underserved Area

HPSA:

MUA:

Census Tracts



DC City Council Wards



DCPC Results Summary

Census tract Groupings (CTG)

The four variables used to define the 11 CTGs for the District of Columbia are as follows:

- Housing density
- Ethnic mix
- Access to community health facilities, and
- Identity (of the community)

Derivation of the Census Tract Groupings (CTG) used in this study Source: DCPC; DC CPH MCH; Koba Associates 1984

стб	HOUSING DENSITY	ETHNIC MIX	ACCESS TO NHC	COMMUNITY DENTITY
1	HIGH	HISPANIC & OTHER	ADAMS MORGAN NHC	ADAMS MORGAN, WARD1
2	HIGH	MIXED	SOUTHWEST NHC	SW & ADJACENT
3	LOW	MAJORITY WHITE	NONE	WARD 3
4	LOW	MIXED	NONE	WARD 4
5	LOW-TO-	BLACK, AGING	WOODRIDGE NHC	BROOKLAND/MICHIGAN
	MODERATE			PARK/ FORT TOTTEN
6	TOWNHOUSES	MIXED, BUT	CENTER 17, ARTHUR	CAPITOL HILL, WARD 6
		PREDOM. BLACK	CAPPER NHC	
7	MODERATE	BLACK	BENNING RD,	EAST-OF-THE-RIVER
			EAST-OF-THE-RIVER	
8	HIGH	BLACK	ANACOSTIA NHC,	WARD 8/ANACOSTIA
			CONGRESS HTS NHC	
9	HIGH	MIXED	"R" STREET NHC	DUPONT CIRCLE / SHAW
10	MEDIUM	BLACK	HUNT PLACE NHC, BENNING ROAD NHC	UPPER WARD 7, FAR NORTHEAST
				LOWEST-INCOME

Component census tracts for each of the eleven DC Census Tract Groupings (CTGs) used in the DCPC Primary Care Needs Assessment Study, District of Columbia, 1985, 1992, 2004

<u>CTG Component D.C. Census Tracts</u>

Andeb DCPC

Needs

2004

11

Assessment Study, 1985-

- **1** 29, 30, 31, 32, 34, 35, 36, 37, 38, 39, 41, 27.01, 27.02, 28.01, 28.02, 40.01, 40.02
- **2** 56, 58, 59, 61, 64, 65, 70, 72, 82, 57.01, 60.01, 60.02, 62.01, 63.01, 63.02
- **3** 1, 3, 4, 6, 11, 12, 15, 2.01, 2.02, 5.01, 5.02, 7.01, 7.02, 8.01, 8.02, 9.01, 9.02, 10.01, 10.02, 13.01, 13.02, 14.01, 14.02
- **4** 16, 24, 26, 17.01, 17.02, 18.01, 18.02, 18.04, 19.01, 19.02, 20.01, 20.02, 21.01, 21.02, 22.01, 22.02, 25.01, 25.02
- **5** 94, 23.01, 23.02, 33.01, 92.01, 92.03, 92.04, 93.01, 93.02, 95.01, 95.03, 95.04, 95.05, 95.07, 95.08, 95.09
- **6** 66, 67, 69, 71, 81, 84.01, 68.01, 68.02, 68.04, 79.01, 79.03, 80.01, 80.02, 83.02
- **7** 75.02, 75.03, 75.04, 76.01, 76.03, 76.04, 76.05, 77.03, 77.07, 77.08, 77.09, 99.01, 99.02, 99.05, 99.06, 99.07
- **8** 97, 73.01, 73.02, 73.04, 73.08, 74.01, 74.03, 74.04, 74.05, 74.06, 74.07, 74.09, 98.01, 98.02, 98.03, 98.04, 98.06, 98.07, 98.08, 98.09

Source J. **9** 43, 44, 50, 51, 55, 42.01, 42.02, 49.01, 49.02, 52.01, 52.02, 53.01, 53.02, 54.01

20 78.03, 78.04, 78.06, 78.07, 78.08. 78.09, 89.03, 89.04, 91.01, 96.01, 96.02, 96.03, 96.04, 99.03, 99.04

46, 47, 85, 86, 33.02, **40, 12, 02, 83.01, 84.02, 87.01, 87.02, 88.02, 88.03, 88.04, 91.02**

21

DC: Census Tract Groupings (CTG)



Baseline Comparing Physician Ratios per 1,000 population



DC Poverty Rates: By Census Tract Tract



<u>1989</u>	Poverty rate	<u>Child</u> poverty rate
DC	<mark>33% (</mark> 188,514)	35%
<u>2010</u>		
DC	<mark>19.2%</mark> (109,423)	30%
Maryland	9.9%(557,140)	13%
Virginia	11.1%(861,969)	14%

Active DC Physicians: #, rate per 100,000 population



DC Phys per 1,000 population: By Census Tract Grouping







<u>Total Physicians licensed by the</u> <u>District of Columbia</u>

- The District had a total of **11,068** licensed physicians in 1985 and **9,675** in 2004
- a **12.6 percent decrease** from 1985 to 2004
- the <u>majority</u> of these DC-licensed physicians <u>did not live or practice</u> in the District of Columbia.

Physicians in DC: 1985 to 2010

SOURCE: District of Columbia Primary Care (DCPC) Needs Assessment Study, 1985 to 2004.

	Total DC Licensed Physicians	Physicians practising in DC	Primary care Physicians	primary care physicians as % of practising physicians
1984-1985	11,068	2,543	1,444	56.8
1990-1992	9,675	3,863	2,120	54.9
2004-2005	9,675	3,635	1,622	44.6
2010* * estimates from DC Board of Medicine, 2010 study	8,940	~4,000	918	22.9

DC Physicians: Comparing #Licensed, #Practising and #Primary Care



Assessment Study, 1985-2004

<u>Physicians in DC – summary</u>

- Decreasing #s of total physicians and decreasing #s of primary care physicians in the nation's capital is a <u>LONG-TERM TREND.</u>
- In 1985, of the total **11,068** physicians licensed by the District, only **2,543** (primary care physicians plus specialists) <u>actually practiced in</u> the District of Columbia in 1985.
- There were 3,863 actual practising physicians in the District in 1990 and 3,635 in 2004.
- <u>UPDATE:</u>

A new study released in October 2011 by the DC Board of Medicine shows that **8,940** doctors are licensed to work in the nation's capital but only about 4,000 practice in the District today.

Changes in Number of Primary Care Physicians, District of Columbia, 1985 to 2010

	1984–1985	1990-1992	2004-2005	2010
TOTAL PRIMARY CARE PHYSICIANS	1,444	2,120	1,622	918
TOTAL ALL PHYSICIANS	2,543	3,863	3,635	4,000

Trend Line ... <u>Total</u> vs. <u>Primary Care</u> Physicians, District of Columbia, 1985 to 2010



Assessment Study, 1985-2004

Primary Care Physicians, <u>By Specialty</u> District of Columbia, 1985 to 2010

	1984–1985	1990-1992	2004–2005	2010*
IM	660	564	870	382
PED	344	340	352	307
OB/GYN	256	247	146	110
FP/GP	222	187	153	119

Trend Line Primary Care Physicians By Specialty, District of Columbia, 1985 to 2010



Changes in # of Primary Care Physicians by CTG, District of Columbia, 1985-2004



DCPC Results: By Census Tract Grouping (C.T.G.)

Primary Care Service Index (PCSI)

By Census Tract Grouping, District of Columbia, 1985-2004

<1 shortage area

D.C.	1985	1990	2004
CENSUS			
TRACT	PCSI	PCSI	PCSI
GROUPING			
1	3.04	1.97	0.80
2	5.59	2.57	2.40
3	4.06	0.56	1.40
4	1.07	7.04	1.70
5	4.91	11.54	2.60
6	1.16	2.69	1.20
7	0.49	8.97	0.20
8	0.81	2.19	0.10
9	10.60	0.23	6.10
10	0.25	1.11	0.60
11	0.17	7.45	4.20
TOTAL, DC	2.62	3.97	1.80

Composite Need Scores (CNS)

By Census Tract Grouping, District of Columbia, 1985-2004

CNS < 50% = area of need

				1985-
	1985	1990	2004	2004
CENSUS				
				CNS %
TRACT	CNS	CNS	CNS	CHANGE
GROUPING				
1	77.3	59.1	54.3	-23.0
2	40.9	72.7	48	7.1
3	100.0	95.5	80.8	-19.2
4	86.4	95.5	65.9	-20.5
5	72.7	45.5	56	-16.7
6	63.6	72.7	56.6	-7.0
7	31.8	18.2	39.2	7.4
8	13.6	22.7	27.3	13.7
9	50.0	36.4	64.3	14.3
10	31.8	36.4	36.3	4.5
11	13.6	36.4	41.7	28.1

53.7

52.5

-0.4

52.9

DC

Primary Care PRIORITY AREAS, 1985

LEGEND:







	CNS			
	1	2	3	4
PCSI				
1	CTG 11			
2		CTG 7, 10		
3				
4	CTG 8			
5		CTG 2	CTG 5, 6, 9	CTG 1, 3, 4

Primary Care PRIORITY AREAS, 1992

LEGEND:







	CNS			
	1	2	3	4
PCSI				
1		CTG 9		
2				
3				CTG 3
4				
5	CTG 7,8	CTG 5, 10, 11	CTG 1, 2, 6	CTG 4

Primary Care PRIORITY AREAS, 2004

LEGEND:







	CNS			
	1	2	3	4
PCSI				
1		CTG 7, 8		
2				
3		CTG 10		
4			CTG 1	
5		CTG 2, 11	CTG 3, 4, 5, 6, 9	

This DCPC model may be used to predict

Primary Care PRIORITY AREAS for 2012, 2016, 2020

Regression Model: Predicting primary care visits By CTG areas

Model Summary

a Predictors: (Constant), POP65P, LBWP, CTG, POPLT17, POVP2000

b Dependent Variable: VISNEED

					Change Statistics:					
Model	R	R squared	Adjusted	Std. Error of the Estimate	R Square Change	F Change	df1	df2	Sig. F Change	Durbin- Watson
1	.457	.209	.186	131086.2	.209	9.390	5	178	.000	2.068

APHA Theme: "Healthy Communities Promote Healthy Minds and Bodies"

DCPC's Community of Interest: The Five P's

- Policymakers
- Planners
- Physicians / providers / other practitioners
- Programs (staff), and
- Public / general population

DCPC - Recommendations

- I.Policy-makers and planners should encourage use of DC Census Tract Groupings for collecting, aggregating and analyzing public health and primary care data
- 2.Providers and practitioners must support health reform in the District of Columbia by assuring that all residents, poor and nonpoor, have access to a community-based, available and affordable primary care physician
- 3.The geographic mal-distribution of primary care physicians must be addressed by public policy in the District by identifying needs and gaps in shortage areas, especially communities east-of-the-river
- 4.The District should focus on primary <u>prevention</u>, early intervention and health education to address each community's specific needs.

5. Public-private partnerships must ensure closer communications between a resident, his or her primary care physician, nurse practitioner, social services, and other community supports. Assessment Study, 1985-2004

References

- Andoh, J., MS, MPH, CPM., Ndubuisi, S. C, PhD., Kelley, M., M.D., Saunders, C., M.D. MPH, Hester, R., PhD., Kofie, V., PhD. "How Healthy is the District of Columbia – A Ten–Year Analysis of Mortality, Morbidity and Health Risks Behaviors, 1986–1996," Commission of Public Health, Preventive Health Services Administration, 1998, p.1, Occasional Reports, Vol. 1 No. 4, April 1998.
- Bowman, R. C., M.D., Decreasing Rural FP Physicians, Retrieved May 1, 2004, from http://www.unmc.edu/Community/ruralmeded/fpgrad/decreasing_rural _fp.htm
- Burt C. W., Schappert, S. M. (2002). Ambulatory care visits to physician offices, hospital outpatient departments, and emergency departments. United States, 1999–2000. National Center for Health Statistics. Vital and Health Stat. In preparation.
- Cherry, D. K., and Woodwell, D. K., "National Ambulatory Medical Care Survey: 2000 Summary," Advance Data No. 328. 32 pp. (PHS) 2002– 1250, Division of Health Care Statistics, National Centers for Health Statistics, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Hyattsville, Maryland, June, 2002.

- Cherry, D. K., Burt, C. W., & Woodwell, D. A. (2003). Advance Data from Vital and Health Statistics, Number 337, National Ambulatory Medical Care Survey: 2001 Summary, August 11, 2003, p. 3.
- Clancy, C., Cooper, J. (March, 1998). Approaches to Primary Care: Current Realities and Future Visions. The American Journal of Medicine, 104: 215-218. AHCPR Publication No. 98-R051.
- Dartmouth Atlas of Health Care. (2000). Center for Evaluative Clinical Sciences, Dartmouth University Medical School. Retrieved May 1, 2004 from

http://www.dartmouthatlas.org/99US/chap_8_sec_4_1.php

- Donaldson, M. S., Yordy, K. D., Lohr, K. N., and Vanselow, N. A., (eds), Primary Care: America's Health in a New Era, Committee on the Future of Primary Care, Institute of Medicine, 2001, pp. 27– 51.
- Carretta, H. J., 2000, "Primary care service areas: a new tool for the evaluation of primary care services").

- Indices, A Statistical Index to District of Columbia Services. (1992). Washington, DC: Government of the District of Columbia, Office of Policy and Evaluation, December 1992, pp. 29-30. Library of Congress Catalogue Number/ISSN 09895-027X
- Kofie, V. Y., Mitchell, C., Brown, D. Y., Ndubuisi, Samuel C., Andoh, J. Y., Nzeribe A. (1994). Risk Behaviors Among the Residents of the District of Columbia, DC Behavioral Risk Factor Surveillance System, Report Vol. 1, No. 1, Preventive Health Services Administration, Commission of Public Health, 800 9th St, SW, Washington, DC, 20024.
- Lurie, N., Stoto, M. (2002). Health Insurance Status in the District of Columbia, Rand Corporation, for District of Columbia Primary Care Association, Baskerville, S., Exec. Dir., Washington, DC.
- McCaig, L. F., Ly N. National Hospital Ambulatory Medical Care Survey: 2000 emergency department summary. Advance data from vital and health statistics; no. 326. Hyattsville, Maryland: National Center for Health Statistics. 2002.

- Ndubuisi S. C., PhD., Kofie V. Y., PhD., Andoh J. Y., MS, MPH, CPM., Schwartz E. M., MD., *Black-white differences in stage at presentation of prostate cancer in the District of Columbia.* Urology, *46:* 771–777, 1995. Abstract is available and was retrieved on May 11, 2004 from http://cebp.aacrjournals.org/cgi/content/full/9/12/1323
- Oleson, F., Dickinson, J., & Hjortdahl, P. (2004). General practice – time for a new definition. British Medical Journal, 2000;320:354–357, February, 2004.
- Pasley, B., Vernon, P., Gibson, G., McCauley, M., and Andoh, J. *Geographic variations in elderly hospital and surgical discharge rates*, New York State, American Journal of Public Health, Vol 77, Issue 6 679–684, Copyright © 1987 by American Public Health Association. Abstract is available on May 11, 2004 from www.ajph.org/cgi/content/abstract/77/6/679

- Philips, J., PhD., Johnson-Clarke, F., PhD., Wilson, C., MPH., Sumner, J., PhD., Manzur, H., PhD. "Draft Briefing paper on the Infant Mortality Rate in the District of Columbia, 1991–2000," Table 1, State Center for Health Statistics, Department of Health, Government of the District of Columbia, February, 2002.
- Poage, James F., PhD. "Natural Market Areas for Primary Care Health Services: How does one determine them? How does one publish the information? Why does one care?." *Twentieth Annual ESRI International User Conference.* CD-ROM. August 2000.
- Primary Care Needs Assessment (PCNA), Bureau of Primary Care, Rural, and Ethnic Health, Utah Department of Health, Retrieved May 1, 2004, from http://gils.utah.gov/stubs/pcna.html, January, 2000.
- Resources, Bureau of Primary Health Care. (April 2004). U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, East West Towers, 4350 East West Highway, Bethesda, Maryland 20814. Retrieved May 1, 2004 from http://www.bphc.hrsa.gov.
- Simon, C. J., Dranove, D., & White, W. D. (1998). The effect of managed care on the incomes of primary care and specialty physicians. Health Services Research, August 1998. Retrieved May 7, 2004 from http://www.hospitalconnect.com/hsr/PDF/33549.pdf

- Tuckson, R., Levy, M., Rivo, M., Schwartz, K., Kofie, V. "Black/White Comparisons of Premature Mortality for Public Health Program Planning – District of Columbia," 1989, p.1, MMWR Weekly, January 27, 1989 / 38(3);33–37; Retrieved on May 10, 2004 from www.cdc.gov/mmwr/preview/mmwrhtml/00001337.htm
- U.S. General Accounting Office. 1995. Health Care Shortage Areas: Designation is Not a Useful Tool for Directing Resources to the Underserved. GAO/T-HEHS-95-200. Washington, DC: U.S. General Accounting Office.
- U. S. General Accounting Office. 2003. Physician Supply Increased in Metropolitan and Non-metropolitan Areas but Geographic Disparities Persisted: GAO-04-124: Physician Workforce, Report Highlights. United States General Accounting Office, 441 G Street NW, Room 7149, Washington, D.C. 20548. October 2003.

- Vernon, P., Gordon, D., McCormack, J., "Primary Care Analysis Areas (PCAA)," NYS Health Planning Commission, Department of Health, Albany, N.Y., 1983, pp. 1–30.
- Wagener, D. K., Klein, R. J., "Healthy People 2000," Preface and Foreword, National Center for Health Statistics. Healthy People 2000 Final Review, Hyattsville, Maryland: Public Health Service. 2001. Library of Congress Catalog Card Number 76-641496.
- White, E. L., Fuchsberg, R. R., Haase, K., Wilson, R. W., Gleeson, G. A. "Volume of Physician Visits, United States – July 1966 to June 1967, (1968), DHEW Publication No. 76–1299, U.S. Department of Health, Education and Welfare, Public Health Service, Health Resources Administration, National Center for Health Statistics; (First issued in the Public Health Service Publication No. 1000 Series 10–No. 49, Reprinted as DHEW Publication No. (HRA) 76–1299), Rockville, Maryland, November, 1968, Table A, p. 3.
- World Health Organization, International Conference on Primary Care for All By 2000, "Declaration of Alma-Ata," Alma-Ata, Russia (formerly the Soviet Union), 1978, p. 1, Retrieved on May 10, 2004 from www.who.dk/AboutWHO/Policy/20010827_1, pp. 1-2.

DCPC Study - contact/information:

STUDY AUTHOR/RESEARCHER:

Jacob Andoh, MS, MPH, CPM, PhD(cand) Department of Human Services/FSA 645 H. Street, NE, 4th Floor Washington, DC 20002 (202) 698–4166

Send requests for information to:

- Jacob Andoh
- > 1702 Doral Court
- Mitchellville, MD 20721
- > (301) 499–5636

Or send email to: jyandoh@yahoo.com