Performance-based Financing to Improve Supply Chain Practices and Increase Medicine Availability at the Community Level: Lessons from Rwanda

Alexis Heaton, Megan Noel, Catherine Mugeni Murasa, Patrick Njagri M., Deogratias Leopold, Golbert KAZOZA, Mildred Shieshia, Sarah Andersson, Savitha Subramaniam, Yasmin Chandani

SC4CCM Project
Supply Chains for Community Case Management (SC4CCM) is a learning project that worked with the Ministry of Health (MOH) in Rwanda to strengthen community level supply chain practices and improve product availability with community health workers (CHWs) through locally appropriate and sustainable interventions.

ICSCI Intervention
Aimed at operationalizing RSPs and addressing motivation
• Tested 9 supply chain indicators – Designed to improve performance in key supply chain areas – Indicators weighted based on contribution to supply chain performance • Added to MOH’s existing community Performance Based Financing system (PBF) • CHWs in cooperatives scored quarterly • Provided transport and communication allowance to cell coordinators (CCs) monthly to support supply chain processes and tasks • Tested for one year (four quarters of performance data) before evaluation

Nine Supply Chain Indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Minimum Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The proportion of CHWs who attended health center meetings in the past quarter</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The proportion of CHWs for whom stock card data was included on all resupply reports in the past quarter</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The proportion of CHWs with stock card data for CCM products on day of visit</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The proportion of CHWs who have at least one treatment for a five year old child in stock, for each CCM product on day of visit</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The proportion of CHWs with no expired CCM products on day of visit</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. The proportion of CHWs who have at least one treatment for a five year old child in stock, for each CCM product on day of visit</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. The proportion of self-coordinators who presented complete resupply worksheets during monthly health centre meetings in the past quarter</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. The proportion of self-coordinators who presented complete resupply worksheets without any calculation errors during monthly health centre meetings, in the past quarter</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. The proportion of self-coordinators who need products, who collect them for their cell from the pharmacy after health center meetings, in the past quarter</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results
The incentives group showed improvement in critical supply chain performance elements:
- Stock card availability was significantly higher for 5 out of 6 products in incentives vs. comparison group At midline, 45% of CHWs in incentives group had all 3 CCM products in stock on day of visit, compared to 33% of CHWs in comparison group Fewer stockouts in ICSCI group than non intervention districts for 4 of 6 products, and significantly fewer for Primo Rouge (ACTs)

Conclusions
• Results show that incentives can stimulate behavior change towards good performance of a routine practice when health workers are motivated they strive to ensure quality while performing supply chain tasks • The addition of supply chain indicators to the PBF brings attention to and signals the importance of the supply chain and supply chain tasks in improving service delivery at community level • Worked well because of existing PBF infrastructure and experience

Indicators with significant change across all districts (3)
• Indicators that showed no significant change in all districts (2)

SC4CCM and MOH Rwanda Approach
• Conducted a baseline survey of the community supply chain in 2010; results used to: – Design standard resupply procedures (RSP) to lay the foundation and – Test incentives for community Supply Chain Improvement (ICSCI) in 3 districts
• Evaluated impact of interventions through midline survey in May 2012
• Collected data on product availability and supply chain performance in intervention and comparison districts
• Analyzed quarterly data from supply chain incentives database including quarterly scores and payments from each cooperative

Key Learnings
• Incentives contributed to improvement in the following supply chain practices: – reduced expiries, improved product availability, reduced stock out periods, and shorter lead times – reporting—high levels of timeliness in report submission – recording—improved stock card accuracy – improvement in collection and movement of logistics data

FGDs: Feedback & Motivation
• Incentives for Community Supply Chain Improvement (ICSCI): Leveraged existing performance-based incentive scheme to incentivize CHWs

Key Points: Summary of CHW supplemental SC checklist, CHW Supervisor log and evaluation report. Supplemental SC checklist for CHW scoring sheet

ICSCI Intervention

Results

SC4CCM and District

Conclusions

Indicators with significant change in all districts

“Perhaps the most important thing I saw was that this incentive money helped reduce stock outs, CCs and CHWs all work as a team well coordinated to make sure they score high.”

—CHW Supervisor, Burera